[Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh]

(e) to attempt a broad estimate of the volume of black money generated; and

(f) to undertake any regional or sectoral surveys that may be required in connection with the above.

The Institute submitted its report in March, 1985. The report was released to the Press in June, 1985, for encouraging a public debate on the subject so that the consequential suggestions could be considered for drawing up a "Long Term Fiscal Policy". I am placing a copy (Both in Hindi and in English versions) of summary of the Report on the Table of the House. Copies of the Report (in English version and 2 typed copies in Hindi version) have been placed in the Parliament Library.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Madam ...

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh): Madam ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you remember, in the morning during the discussion with the Chairman, we thought that a full discussion on black money could take place. So do you think it necessary to ask for clarifications?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has agreed to have a full-fledged discussion.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I would like to say something else also. This is a very important document and I see no reason why it should be placed only in the Library of Parliament for reference by Members. If the difficulty is simply that the Hindi translation is not ready, I would say, we could have it after a few days. But a printed copy must be made available because this is a document which we would like to have with us.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I shall arrange that every Member gets a copy. The idea of a debate on it is welcome because I will benefit by the suggestions of honourable Members. It is a serious area in which we want to make an effort and formulate our policy. I thing it will be fair enough for the honourable Members also that the date of the debate be fixed when they get a copy and have had time enough to study it.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Let us get a copy and let us also have an early debate.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): I have looked into the summary. But the summary looks to be very odd. And you have said "I am placing a copy of the summary of the report." But that summary which was circulated in the Consultative Committee is wholly inadequate. Therefore, my request to you is please supply the report itself.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: When I say the full report, not the summary but the full report, the original report. And the original report will overrule anything which is in the summary.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala): When he says he is prepared to present the report, I would like to know whether he will present the dissent note made by Shri Arun Kumar in that report and whether it would be available for discussion.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I will present whatever is there in the report.

(iv) Crash of Air-India Jumbo Jet "KANISHKA" on June 23, 1985.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI ASHOK GEHLOT): Sir, An Air-India Boeing 737.237E

aircraft 'Kanishka' operating a scheduled flight, AI-182 Montreal-London Delhi-Bombay with 329 persons on board including 22 crew members crashed on 23rd June, 1985 in the Atlantic Ocean about 185-nautical miles south west of Shannon (Ireland) at about 0713 hours GMT, corresponding to about 1243 hours IST. The aircraft was cruising at a hieght of about 31,000 feet at that time.

Search and rescue operations were initiated immediately. No survivors were found. This was the worst disaster in the history of civil aviation in India. Our hearts go out in sympathy to the bereaved families.

On receipt of the information, action was immediately initiated in accordance with the contingency plan for dealing with accidents. Emergency Cells were constituted at the booking offices at Bombay and Delhi airports. Facilities for providing information to all concerned were made available. I sincerely regret the inconvenience caused to the relatives of staff attending to enquiries.

A high level team led by Secretary, Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation, proceeded to London and Cork early in the morning of 24th June, 1985 to gather information connected with the accident, including recovery of wrackage particularly the Black Box, to supervise relief and rescue operations and to make arrangements for identification and disposal of dead bodies.

Air India provided free transportation to London/Cork and back to one relative per family. In certain cases, this facility had to be provided to more than one person. Free hotel accommodation, food and transport and also a cash allowance was provided to the next of kin who went to Cork in connection with the crash. A total of 305 persons travelled to Cork for purposes of identification.

In all, 131 bodies could be recovered from the sea. Autopsy on all the bodies was completed on the 28th June, 1985 and embalming carried out by 29th June, 1985. Facilities were provided by Air India and Indian Airlines for carriage of the dead bodies free of cost to the destinations indicated by the next of kin. 117 bodies have been identified so far, leaving 14 unidentified. The unidentified bodies have been preserved as per the advice of the Irish Coroner. These bodies will be available for visual identification till 30th July, 1985. Thereafter suitable action will be taken for their disposal.

Foreign Governments, i.e. British, American, Canadian and of course other had actively participated in the search and rescue operations. A French Cableship Leon Thevenian hired by us having a submersible Robet fitted with the latest equipment for location and salvage brought out the Cockpit Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder also known as the Black Box, from a depth of more than 6,000 feet. Recorder of these black boxes from such a great depth is an unprecedented feat in the history of salvage operations of this kind. Both Recorders have been brought to India for examination and analysis, which is underway. No conclusions can be drawn at this stage.

The Government of India have appointed a sitting Judge of Delhi High Court as a Court to investigate into the accident. He would be assisted by five assessors. The Court is expected to submit its report to the Government by 31st December, 1985. They have started their work.

The compensation, in accordance with the rules, will be paid expeditiously to the next of kin.

We have initiated a thorough review of security arrangements at our airports. I would like to assure the House that no effort will be spared to ensure the safety of the travelling public.

[Shri Ashok Gehlot]

I must express my sincere gratitude to the Government and people of Ireland for the humanitarian and material help which they extended so spontaneously in the tragic hour of need. I am also grateful to the authorities of all the other countries which assisted us in relief and rescue operations.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Sukomal Sen.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Madam, apart from what has been published by the newspapers all these days, not a single piece of new information has been supplied by the Minister to the Rajya Sabha. So, I do not know why the Minister has chosen to come out with a statement with this information which is known to everybody.

Madam, the Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder have been retrieved from the deep sea and the authorities have started examining them and many things are coming out in the newspapers these days. On that, Madam, the statement is completely silent.

Madam, this incident, this "Kanishka" disaster, is perhaps the worst in the aviation history not only of our country, but also of the whole world. So many persons have been killed. Now, Madam, the Cockpit Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder have been retrieved and they are under examination in Bombay. A Commission of Inquiry has been constituted, the Kirpal Commission, and they are going into it. But I would like to know from the honourable Minister whether he would like to inform the House if the Government has any *Prima facie* reason to believe that this disaster was caused by an act of sabotage, I mean, by an explosion inside the aircraft. Nowadays, Madam, there are reports in the newspapers that not only from the Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder, but also from the Shannon airport tapes, many things are revealed. According to the newspaper reports, the Shannon airpor tapes are revealing more information about this disaster. According to one source, after the Shannon tapes have been decoded, it has been learnt there is conclusive evidence that an explosion took place inside the aircraft. On all these things the Minister is totally silent. I would therefore, like the honourable Minister to tell whether there is any *prime facie* reason to believe that this was due to an act of sabotage and, if so, by whom it was done, whether there is any link between the explosion that took place inside the aircraft and almost the simultaneous explosion in Narita airport when some people were unloading the cargo from a Canadian aircraft. I would like to know whether there is any link between these two explosions and, if so, whether there is any Khalistani hand in this.

Madam, there is another thing also. There is another news item in this connection. When the Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder were retrieved and were to be brought to India, America and Canada objected to their being brought to India for examination and their plea was that India has no expertise to decode them. What are the reasons actually for the USA and Canada's objection to bringing the instruments to India? I would like to know whether any American experts or Canadian experts have been associated with the decoding and examination process of these two instruments that have been brought to Bombay and, if so, whether the Government is getting their full cooperation. Already there is a news. The Americans have started saying that this disaster has not been caused due to explosion, not due to sabotage, but for other reasons. Some newspapers in America are saying that it is some insurance cover that has caused this disaster. I would like to know from the Government whether they have any facts about it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. Mr. Suresh Kalmadi.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): I would lend support to what Mr. Sukomal Sen has said about the Voice Recorder. Definitely we have the capacity in India to decode the Cockpit Voice Recorder. But definitely we do not have the sophisticated equipment as they have in Washington for the Flight Data Recorder. So I think that is the reason why they have kept quiet about it. If they have to send it there, I think they should send it earlier because the entire country is anxious to know what went wrong with the aircraft. I am very, very surprised at the Minister's statement which is silent about these aspects, whether it was explosion or it was sabotage. There is not one line in the statement about it. So many days have passed. I would like to know the reason whether it was a bomb explosion. I personally do not subscribe to the bomb theory because there is not one person with a burn mark. It could be structural failure. If it were a bomb explosion at 33000 ft., the pieces of the aircraft would have been spread far and wide. But we find that the wreckage of the aircraft was very much localised. If it is due to structural failure, it is a very serious matter. The Government must investigate whether the aircraft was serviced properly. If it is a structural failure, a major structural failure, I would like to ask to the hon. Minister whether the Air India proposes to ground all the 747's immediately for a thorough check-up and the experts from the Company, Indian experts, go through it, rip open the aircraft and see if any part of the structure has a weak link. This is very important. So my plea to the Minister is that they may immediately be grounded and checked up in a matter of a few days, and then they should start flying.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaswant Singh.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Rajasthan): Madam Deputy Chairman, it is my unhappy task to be discussing this particular matter. It is very distressing. It is not easy for Members to discuss such an unhappy event. I am also particularly distressed, Madam, that while making his statement the hon. Minister should find it necessary to point out to one particular technological something, on account of which the Voice Recorder and the Datat Recorder were recovered as if it were some kind of an achievement either of Air India or of the Government of India. It is grotesque to put it in that manner. It is a part of the Minister's statement. It is in extremely bad taste. I do not wish to go into such aspects, as are within the purview of the equiry commission, which is going into why the accident took place, what were the causes which led to it, whether it was structural failure, whether it is some astral body which struck the aircraft. These are all matters for Justice Kirpal to decide. No doubt, once the inquiry is over, the hon. Minister will take the House into confidence and inform us about it

I am going to seek some clarifications on the Minister's assurances about flight safety which are included in his statement. I would like to point out that on the question of flight safety, an Air India official who is also the Vice-Chairman of Pilots' Association, Capt. Basu, has said: Why should it have to be an accident which takes the lives of 350 people to make us alert to the problems that confront Air India or the Aviation industry as such? Why ought it to be the price paid by these 350 people to make us alert to this problem? In the light of this statement and in the light of the former founder Chairman of Air India, Mr. Tata, having said that Air India has become a second-rate airline, I would like to ask the hon. Minister about it.

[Shri Jaswant Singh]

Mr. Tata is on record as having said it, in fact, he said it in writing in November, 1983, to the then Chairman. He pointed out various shortcomings of safety operations, difficulties of coordination between crew and cabin attendants, etc. Despite all this, Air India officials and Air India management continue to spread the confusion on the question of flight safety. I would like to illustrate it just by one example which is about deboarding such baggage as has been checked in by a passenger and the passenger has not turned up to board the aircraft. Is it not a fact that on March 25, 1983, Air India, *vide* a circular No. Operation/HQ/Gen/83/17, said:

> "It has, therefore, been decided that in future no flight should be delayed in order to identify, locate and remove the baggage of passengers who have been prevented to travel by the authorities referred to above."

This is a circular issued by the Air India management debarring captains of the aircraft from unloading baggage of such persons as have not turned up having checked in I have bgiven the reference number of this circular. In fact this is not the end of the story. In the light of this particular circluar which has given in instructions to the Air India captains that they would not delay flights on account of baggage which has arrived in the aircraft and the passenger has not arrived, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether this circular has not become a contributory factor to the Montreal incident in which baggage had been checked in on board the aircraft and the passenger has not arrived. Therefore, Air India cannot absolve itself of the responsibility for the accident that has taken place on this sector. I would like to know from the Minister what was the advice on flight safety that he had received from IATA, from ICAO and from the India Federation of Airlines Pilots' Association. Is that advice mandatory? Did you follow that advice as far as Air India is concerned? Will you give us one example where that advice was followed? Madam, I don't have the time. I can give numerous other instances where it has not been followed. My third question or clarification is this. What were the additional safety measures that were introduced by Air India following upon the grave deterioration in the law and order situation in the country? And certainly, as far as aviation security is concerned, from about 1981 onwards, what were the additional security measures that were introduced? Were they followed, because I have here quotations from the Airline's captains and pilots who have said that the Airlines safety precautions have a kind of periodicity; that following upon an incident, there is suddenly a spurt, and suddenly every kind of security aspect is taken as if it is a panic reaction and a week later all those measures are taken off. I would also, in the same vein, like to say that we had an incident which we discussed in this House. The late Prime Minister was to undertake an international journey and there was a question and there were fears about sabotage being committed on an Air-India plane that she was to carry her on this journey. An enquiry was instituted into that incident. What were the results of that enquiry? Has that enquiry got lost somewhere? Did you find an incident of sabotage? Or was it only a panic reaction? I would like that also to be clarified.

Finally, Madam, it is my understanding that following upon the loss of this aircraft, Lloyds of London who were the insurers have raised some difficulties and questions relating to the payment of insurance of this aircraft, claiming that a terrorist act is analogous to an act of war and, therefore, not covered under the insurance policy taken out by Air-India. Is this apprehension, is this information that I have correct? Further, because of the difficulties raised by Lloyds of London, Air-India's plans to charter, to take on lease 20 Air Buses from France have also been thrown into jeopardy

because France's Aero-Spatiale have now come forward and said that until this querry by Lloyds is resolved, that a terrorist act is analogous to an act of war and, therefore, insurance cover is not available, we will not be in a position to give you 20 Air Bus aircraft on lease, which is a vital programme which Air-India has for its expansion and modernisation. If Aero-Spatiale have come forward with this querry, I would like the Minister to inform us about this fact also and what Air-India is doing to sort out this tangle of insurance.

Madam, there is just one final concluding sentence. Because we are not going to have a discussion on this subject, we are not going to be debating on this subject in this session of Parliament which in any case, as I started by saying is an unhappy subject, we try not to discuss such an unhappy matter and, therefore, it is all the more incumbent on the Minister that whatever queries are raised now by the Members are adequately and fully answered. Thank you.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, the statement given by the Minister is not full and incomplete It is a very tragic incident in which many eminent scientists, innocent men, women and children lost their lives. We feel very sorry and we express our sympathies. The details which he has given in the statement have already come in the press. In fact, the press has given more details than what the statement contains.

Madam, in the press it has been stated that some organisation has claimed responsibility for this incident. But nothing has been stated here. I would like to know from the Minister whether the Government of India have gone into it and whether they have found out as to who are those who have claimed the responsibility for this incident, and whether that is any truth in it. But nothing has been stated in the statement here. And the press has given some details about it. Secondly, I would like to know from the Minister whether any similar accidents have taken place in any other aircraft manufactured by this very company and if so, what the causes are and whether those incidents are also of a similar nature or not. I would like to know whether the Government of India has made any enquiries about this from the company which manufactured these aircraft abroad. Sir, it is true that the Government of India has taken all the necessary steps immediately. The Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation took all the necessary steps to help the kith and kin of the deceased as soon as they got news of this tragedy. But I would like to know from the Minister whether a thorough check of the passengers and their baggage was made before the plane took off from its originating station. This fact has not been clearly mentioned in the statement. In the press conflicting reports have appeared. I would like to know from the Minister whether a thorough check of the passengers and their baggage was made before it left Toronto That information has not yet come. The hon. Minister should clarify this thing in his reply.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार) : उपसभापति महोदया, वैसे तो इस विषय पर एक इन्क्वायरी कमेटी बैठा दी गई है, इसलिये सारी बातें नहीं आई लेकिन कुछ बातें जो स्पष्ट थीं उसको सरकार की तरफ से छिपाने की कोशिश की गई है । यह अत्यन्त ही दुखद स्थिति है और इसलिये मैं सरकार से इस के बारे में सफाई चाहूंगा ।

पहली तो यह है कि अमेरिका स्थित एक टेरेरिस्ट गैंग ने कहा है कि हमने इसका विस्फोट किया है, हमने सेबोटाज किया है । वह जो दावा करते हैं जब तक यह दावा असत्य नहीं हो जाता तब तक मानना पड़ेगा कि उन्होंने जो कहा है वह सही है । सरकार ने इस बारे में कुछ नहीं कहा है । फिर यह

[श्री चतुरानन मिश्र]

बात आई है कि अमेरिका में ऐसा केन्द्र है जहां ऐसे टेरेरिस्टों को ट्रेनिंग दी जाती है । अखबारों में भी यह आया कि 25 ऐसे ट्रेनिंग सेन्टर्स है जहां इनको ट्रेन्ड किया गया था जिन्होंने वह विस्फोट करने का दावा किया है । उन्होंने कहा कि अलाबामा सेन्टर से उन्होंने ट्रेनिंग प्राप्त की है । अगर ऐसी बात है तो सरकार क्या अमेरिका के ध्यान में इस बात को लाई है या नहीं लाई है और लाई है तो उसका क्या नतीजा हुआ ? मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूं कि जो इसके प्रशिक्षक है उनकी पत्नी ने दावा किया है कि अगर कनिष्क दुर्घटना में लोग मर गये तो मर गये. इसमें हमारा क्या है । हम को कोई दुख नहीं है इस घटना से । अखबारों में भी यह बात आई है । इसलिये क्या सरकार ने इस बारे में कोई तहकीकात की है या नहीं की है ? दूसरे यह कि अमेरिका के जस्टिस डिपार्टमेंट ने कहा है कि यह ट्रेनिंग देना लीगल है और यह ट्रेनिंग होगी और हमारी इस को रोकने की कोई इन्टेन्शन नहीं है । ऐसी हालत में क्या हमने कोई इस पर कार्रवाई की है जिससे यह रुक सके । अगर कोई देश ऐसा करता है तो कम से कम हमें उस एक्ट को अनफ्रैन्डली एक्ट घोषित करना चाहिये क्योंकि वह ऐसा कर रहे है । अगली बात मैं सरकार से कहूंगा कि अभी हमारे मित्र माननीय जसवन्त सिंह जी ने जिसका जिक्र किया मैं भी उनके साथ हूं । वह सरकुलर बहुत ही डिफेक्टिव है । आपने उसमें कहा है कि अनचेक्ड सामान के लिये देरी मत करो । स्पष्ट आदेश हों कि अनचेक्ड सामान वापस करो क्योंकि इसके चलते अनेक दुर्घटनाएं हो सकती है । इन्हीं का एक प्रेस इन्टरव्यू छपा था, यहां के अखबारों में "इंडियन एक्सप्रेस" में 14 जुलाई को, जिसमें एक गम्भीर चार्ज सरकार पर है । मैं चाहता हूं सरकार इसकी सफाई दे । इसका उद्धाहरण मैं देना चाहता हूं । कैप्टन आर के बभू वाइस प्रेजीडेंट, इन्टरनेशनल फेडरेशन आफ एयर लाइन्स पायलेटस एसोसियेशन ने कहा है :

After the genocide which passed off uneventfully everybody thought that the threat was over and the security checks became a mere mechanical routine. Of what use is the x-ray machine if those operating it, their attention is not concentrated on the screen.

मैं जानना चाहूंगा कि क्या एक्सरे मशीन वहां इस्तेमाल की गई या नहीं इस्तेमाल की गई ? और जब यह सीरियस एलीगेशन उसी विभाग के द्वारा आता है तो सरकार को इस बारे में सफाई देनी चाहिये कि स्थिति क्या है । मैं दूसरी बात जो कहना चाहता हूं वह यह है कि एयर इंडिया के अंदर जो सेक्योरिटी इन्तजाम है उसका पिछले वर्षों के अन्दर बहुत ही ह्रास हो गया है । जो डेटा प्रकाशित किया गया है फलाइट इन्टरनेशनल के जरिये से 1973 से 84 के बीच में भारत का स्थान सेक्योरिटी के मामले में 14वां स्थान रह जाता है । बहुत पीछे चला गया है जो आंकड़ा दिया गया है उसके मुताबिक इन वर्षों में 1.3 मिलियन इंडियन फ्लाइट्स के दौरान 424 आदमी की मृत्यु हुई । यह एक ही फ्लाइट कनिष्क के बारे में नहीं है । यह एक ट्रेन्ड हो गया है, जब कि आस्ट्रेलिया में तीन मिलियन फ्लाइट के लिए ओनली टू फेटेलिटीज हुई हैं । मैं जानना चाहूंगा कि यह जो सुरक्षा के मामले में आपकी स्थिति खराब हो गई है, क्या इसके लिए सरकार खुद जिम्मेवार नहीं है ? यह बात स्पष्ट करें। एक बार तो ऐसा हुआ कि 19 मई को 447 विमान बिना पर्याप्त तेल के चला दिया गया और एयर इंडिया के इस जम्बो विमान को बाध्य हो नीचे उतरना पड़ा । बाद में पता चला कि उसमें तेल नहीं था । उसको ट्रैक्टर से खींच कर लाया गया । इस तरह की घटनाओं की खबर अखबारों में आई है । इस प्रकार की दयनीय स्थिति क्या हो गई हैं इसके लिए । सरकार को जिम्मेदारी अपने ऊपर लेनी चाहिए । बाकी बातें जांच में आएंगी, लेकिन जो आपकी स्पष्ट जिम्मेवारी है, उसके बारे में आप जवाब दें ।

श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव (बिहार): माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, प्रश्न तो बहुत पूछे गये हैं और सरकार को उनका उत्तर देना है । लेकिन मेरा इस संबंध में सरकार से यह जानना चाहूंगा कि इरादा क्या है ? अभी यह जो घटना घटी है इसकी जांच बैठाई गई है । यह

विवाद का विषय बना हुआ है कि दुर्घटना बम फटने से हुई या तकनीकी गड़बड़ी से हुई। हमारे बिहार में कुछ दिन पहले यह प्रचलित हो गया था कि आपसी दुश्मनी के कारण भी अगर किसी की हत्या हो जाती है तो लिख दिया जाता था कि नक्सलाइट ने इसको मारा है। पुलिस अपने ऊपर कोई जिम्मेवारी नहीं लेती थी वहीखाते में लिख दिया जाता था कि नक्सलाइट ने इसको मारा है। इसका मतलब यह था कि अगर किसी की हत्या नक्सलाइट्स कर दें तो उसकी जिम्मेवारी पुलिस की नहीं थी। उसी प्रकार से ये जो दुर्घटनाएं हो रही हैं, जैसे यह कनिष्क की दुर्घटना हुई है, कहीं ऐसा तो नहीं है कि सारे सरकारी विभाग, इंडियन विभाग के अधिकारीगण सब मिल कर इस बात में लगे हुए है कि यह दुर्घटना आतंकवाद के कारण हुई है और आतंकवाद के माथे पर इसकी मढ़ना चाहते हैं? मैं चाहता हूं कि इस बात की अच्छी तरह से देखा जाना चाहिए कि यह दुर्घटना तकनीकी कारणों से हुई है या अन्य कारणों से हुई है। कहीं कुछ लोग अपनी अक्षमता को छिपाने के लिए इसको आतंकवाद के माथे पर तो नहीं मढ़ रहे हैं? इसलिए इस मामले की जांच सरसरी तौर पर न करके इसकी गहराई में जाना चाहिए। आकाश में जो इस तरह की दुर्घटनाएं हो रही हैं, उनका क्या कारण है, इसकी गहराई से जांच होनी चाहिए और इस बारे में सरकार को बहुत सचेत से रहना चाहिए। अभी कुछ दिन पहले लखनऊ में एक हवाई जहाज उतरा तो उसका चक्का फट गया। संयोग से यात्रियों को कोई चोट नहीं आई। लेकिन सब चीजों की आतंकवाद के माथे पर गढ़ दिया जाय, इसको देखा जाना चाहिए और इसकी कड़ाई से जांच होनी चाहिए।

आखिरी बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि सुरक्षा की बहुत बात की जाती है। विशिष्ट से विशिष्ट व्यक्ति भी है जो हवाई जहाज से यात्रा करते हैं। उनके लिए सुरक्षा की व्यवस्था की जाती है। लेकिन मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि सभी के लिए नियमों की पाबन्दी एक जैसी होनी चाहिए। कोई वी०आई०पी० है, कोई वी०वी०आई०पी० है, कोई विशिष्ट, कोई महाविशिष्ट और कोई विशिष्टतम से विशिष्टतम व्यक्ति है। सब जगह सुरक्षा में कोई कमी नहीं होनी चाहिए। सुरक्षा की दृष्टि से कोई कमी करना ठीक नहीं है। इसके लिए कड़ी से कड़ी निगरानी रखी जानी चाहिए। एक एक चीज की जांच होनी चाहिए। अगर हम ऐसा करेंगे तो इन दुर्घटनाओं को रोका जा सकता है और सरकार की अपनी क्षमता की आतंकवाद के नाम पर इसको नहीं थोपना चाहिए।

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Madam Deputy Chairman, when the Air-India Jumbo 'Kanishka' plunged into the sea, it was a bolt from the blue on hundreds of families. Families have been subjected to indescribable sorrow and tragedy. Some of the whole families have been wiped out. Nearly 80 children also were killed. Our hearts go in sympathy to those families. If this disaster is due to any sabotage or due to any act of terrorism, in that case, whoever has committed it, they do not deserve to live in a civilised society; whoever is responsible for this diabolical crime, they are not human beings in that case.

Madam, the investigation is going on. Of course, it is a spectacular achievement that the digital flight data recorder and the cockpit voice recorder have been brought to the surface from underneath the sea. Reports indicate that the aircraft broke in mid-air and the communication was totally cut off. But they are not in a position to say what actually happened. Under these circumstances, another theory has also been floated by a London newspaper, 'The Daily Mail'. It has been mentioned:

"A story by the Mail's defence correspondent today said space intelligence investigations in Britain and the U.S. point to unburnt jettisoned parts of Progress 24 entering the earth's atmosphere on the same latitude as the AI Boeing 747 at about the same time as the Jumbo crash. This could have caused the accident. . .

[Shri V. Gopalsamy]

It has been said further:

> "The 'Mail' however, said that it was confirmed that Progress 24, launched on June 20, to take fuel and supplies to two Soviet cosmonauts of the Soyuz T 13, docked with the latter at 6.54 AM, on June 23, the day the AI Jumbo crashed. Just about that time, three booster rockets and other equipment of Progress 24 were jettisoned. They started falling towards earth in a gradually spiralling east to west orbit at 51 deg. 6 min. The motors of the rockets crossed the path of the Jumbo, 15 minutes after the crash. But some other unburnt parts of the rockets could have entered the atmosphere earlier and could have hit the Jumbo flying at 51 deg. 12 min. Since the falling rockets were on the east-west track, they could have hit the plane head on explaining the forward jerk and breaking of neck of 12 of the 131 victims whose bodies have been found."

This may not be correct. But I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the investigating team has applied its mind to this aspect also because these reports have created confusion. That is why, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether this aspect is also being looked into by the investigating team.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Madam, all will agree that this was an unmitigated disaster and a great tragedy in the history of civil aviation. Our sympathies go to those families who have lost their relatives.

Madam Deputy Chairman, I would like to refer to one aspect which has not been touched by others. This is about the time span in which not only this disaster took place but also other disasters. Within a short time, a TWA aircraft was hijacked and there was a great explosion in the Frankfurt airport, destroying a part of the airport. There was also an explosion in Madrid destroying and damaging the airways offices. Apart from the crash of Kanishka there was also an incident in Tokyo. There was also a bomb scare in Rome. All these things happened within a period of 30 to 35 days. I do not know whether it was a coincidence because I cannot explain the sequence of these events and tragedies. I think it is for us to consider how these repeated tragedies, repeated occurrences took place within such a short time. Today international air travel has become a grave risk. It has become a nightmare even in our own country. Whenever we go to the aircraft we always think of ourselves, of our life and our security. It has come to that. There is a story which has been circulated in the Western press, it has not been touched upon by our press and I hope my friend will enlighten us on this. The story is that the X-ray machine in Canada was not operating and, therefore, the packages were not effectively screened. I want to know whether this story has any credibility, whether there is any truth in this theory. Perhaps, Madam, you were in the United States when President Reagan reacted sharply over TWA hijacking and even threatened to cut off American air travel to Athens where the security was supposed to be very weak, lax and inadequate. All the bookings of passengers to Athens were cancelled as a result of this. He gave a call at that time that these occurrences, these tragedies are a challenge, a great challenge, to the civilized world, to the entire international community. He gave a call that there should be an emergency conference at the international level to consider all aspects of air security. Whether this is being considered by the Government of India I would like to know. Is there going to be an international conference to discuss all aspects of air security?

Now my friend Jaswant Singh raised one question. He quoted from a circular which said that the packages

which are already on the board cannot be unloaded even when the passengers are not in the aircraft. Now that has been corrected. Perhaps he knows, now whenever you and I go to the aircraft, there is double checking. There is a security check at the airport itself before we enter the aircraft. Before we enter the aircraft assengers are requested to identify packages. If any passenger cannot ntify the package, that package will be eft over, it will not be taken to the aircraft. I think that care has been taken now, but I would like the Minister to look into the circular which he has referred to and see whether the circular requires changes or amendments in *future*

Lastly, Madam, the security arrangements that have been made already all over the world and also here, are they adequate to meet the challenges that are there? I would like to know whether a suggestion has been made in certain quarters that a marshal, or security men should be there with arms in every aircraft. It is not enough to have double screening. It is very necessary, in addition, to have one or two people equipped with weapons to take care of the hijackers, the terrorists who enter the aircraft surreptitiously. Like, that, I would like to know whether a conference will be called here at the national level—a conference of experts who know the various aspects of security and whether Government is thinking on those lines, whether they can take advantage of the various suggestions that have come forth in this regard.

Lastly, Madam, I would say—I know you are very much tired—that various stories that have been circulated already about the jumbo aircraft are confusing us greatly and the Minister has said that an enquiry will be held and the time limit he has put is December '85. I think it is a long time and I would very much wish that this enquiry should be conducted as expeditiously as possible so that we can do away with all sorts of stories and theories that are being spread. Thank you.

SHRI VISHWA BANDHU GUPTA (Delhi): Naturally we are all with a heavy heart when we discuss a subject like this. I would however like to seek only a few clarifications on this sad affair.

One of them is whether the analysis of the data obtained from the black box and the voice recorder that have been retrieved so ably by robot machine would be a conclusive proof of what actually happened in that aircraft. I would like to know *whether we would still have to depend* on circumstantial evidence or whether this voice recorder and the flight data recorder would give a conclusive story about what actually happened.

The second thing I would like to know from the hon. Minister is whether some effort has been made to study the methodology adopted by El AL of interviewing the passengers before they board the aircraft to find out if wrong passengers, passengers with ill intenions or hijackers are getting on to the aircraft. My able friend, hon'ble Mr. Gurupadaswamy, just now mentioned about identification of the baggage just before entering the aircraft. I thing it is a very important factor and must be strictly adhered to and no unidentified baggage should get on to the aircraft. The Israeli Airlines, as you may have read in the press, take very specific care of interviewing all passengers to find out whether the passenger is getting on to the aircraft with any motive other than just a straight flight. They check about the hotel where they were staying; they check about the receipts; they check about how long they have been residing there, they check about with whom they have been staying whom they had come to meet etc. etc. of course, dogs have been employed to check any trace of fear in passengers. But I would like to know whether dogs

[Shri Vishwa Bandhu Gupta]

have been in adequate numbers to make sure that a thorough check is made of all the passengers and the baggage that goes on to the aircraft.

Lastly, Madam, I would like to know whether there were some passengers who were very very heavily insured and whether insurance compensation to passengers and crew is going to be made quickly and whether there is any timescale for that. Thank you very much.

SHRI R. RAMAKRISHNAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam Deputy Chairman, most of the things have been said and I would not repeat them again. But the whole thing is so tragic that it was really befitting that the Chairman had made an obituary reference to it this morning. If, perhaps, this statement given by the hon. Minister was rather factual but not informative, it is bacause the justice Kripal Court of Inquiry has been ordered and the whole thing is sub-judice and at this stage the Minister did not want to give too many details on very many sensitive and embarrassing things. But here, Madam, I would like just to differ with my friend, Mr. Suresh Kalmadi, though he is a pilot and more knowledgeable than me. He says the possibility of structural failure is more than that of a bomb explosion. But this is not made out by the very many experts who are closely following this. They are subscribing to the theory that this could have only been caused by a bomb explosion. Anyway, the Court of Inquiry will go into all this and come out with the facts. But, I think, I should differ from my friend.

I really congratulate the Government for one thing, that they have not spared any effort and gone the whole hog in trying to get the black box, which is a multi-million dollar operation, with the help of so many Governments. At least in this one aspect the Government of India has given up the usual bureaucratic ways and gone fully. I really congratulate the Minister for this and I hope that this decoding, once it is over, in India, the same will also be sent to the expert decoding centres in Britain as well as in the United States for getting a double check because, as you know, two opinions are always better than one.

Madam, there are various theories which have been advanced. My friend, Mr. Gopalsamy, said about the Russian rocket theory. There are so many other theories. But I would like to know from the Minister whether he has seen a report and whether that has been brought before the Commission, that one international emergency organization going by the name "Decostate" or something like that had received distress signals from the Air-India plane a few seconds before the crash. This is a new organization which has been set up which receives even very sensitive signals from all the aircraft.

Coming to the question of scanning and internal security, Madam, we have our intelligence agencies abroad, and Air-India also should coordinate with the various agencies in the respective countries to have a sort of feedback on the terrorist activites, particularly in countries like Canada and the United Kingdom where many persons are there who are likely to be terrorists. I think there should be some sort of intelligence information so that the checks can also be selective. Now, of course, the checks have been tightened up; I welcome this. In fact, I would also like to know from the Minister what has happend to the Special Sub-Committee of the Civil Aviation Consultative Committee which has been set up to go into the whole thing of security checks within the country—whether that report has been submitted and whether it will be implemented. But coming to security, I think this police dog sniffing and other things, while they are welcome as a random check if the same dog is

given the same work every day, its nose will become very insensitive and so this is not exactly feasible. Only random checking is possible. But I think the security check should be tightened and even VIPs and VVIPs should be made to undergo this special security check.

Now coming to the question of checking in, the baggage and identifying it and all the parade about which Mr. Gopalsamy has stated and about which Mr. Jaswant Singh referred to a circular, here I have a suggestion for the Minister in this connection. A person who checks into a sterile area, once he checks in he should not be allowed to go out and he should be put inside the lounge or somewhere so that there is no question of anybody trying to check in with the baggage and go out and not turn up. This will ensure that no person goes out. So, you can have Indian Airlines or Air-India counters at the plane and as soon as he checks in he has to go into the lounge or some other sterile area and there is no possibility whereby he can go outside the airport. So, this is a suggestion which he should consider.

[The Vice-Chairman (Shrimati Kanak Mukherjee in the Chair.]

About the payment of insurance, it is not to be taken lightly. I do not think a responsible firm like Lloyds or anybody can say that they won't pay, coming to their own conclusions that this was a terrorist act when even the Courts of Inquiry has not completed its work. Auyway, I am sure the Minister and Air-India will be following up all these things closely and I would very much welcome if in this session itself a full scale debate on terrorism and all these things takes place so that more facts can come to light.

Thank you very much, Madam.

3 P.M.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI KANAK MUKHERJEE): Mr. Virendra Verma.

SHRI SUSHIL CHAND MOHUNTA (Haryana): I am to speak on this. My name has been given by Mr. Virendra Verma.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI KANAK MUKHERJEE): All right.

SHRI SUSHIL CHAND MOHUNTA: Thank you, Madam.

Madam, I join all other Members of this House in expressing my deep sense of sorrow over what has happened, over this most tragic incident. Many things have already been said on this subject. I would not like to repeat them.

But, what I am concerned is that, apart from the Commission of Inquiry, the court of inquiry set up, which is going into the circumstances leading to this disaster, which will be giving its finding, not intending at all to encroach upon its jurisdiction, I still maintain that there is a certain area within which we can give our suggestions and can expect that the hon. Minister will clarify certain things to assure us that such incidents during this intervening period till the report comes, such ghastly incidents do not occur again.

The first question is that the crew of the aircraft whether here or in any foreign country, when they board the plane, their belongings, hand-baggages and luggage and all other items must be checked similarly as the items of other passengers are checked, not because they may be in league with the terrorists. I do not expect that at all because their own lives are at stake. But very innocently a packet can be forwarded to any member of the crew or to any VIP or any other passenger boarding the plane. And out of full sense of responsibility one may board the plane, thinking that

[Shri Sushil Chand Mohunta]

everything is well, and yet that packet which has not been checked may be an item which may ultimately explode and the plane and the lives of those people on the board would be put at stake. The story that we have read in the papers is that a packet was given to the pilot at the last minute when he was boarding the plane. Whether that is correct or not, I do not know. But if it is so, that a packet was delivered to him and that packet might have been the packet having an explosive device, due to which this incident occurred, the moral of the story is, we must guard against it and eliminate all chances. Whether they are crew, whether they are passengers, VIPs or any other persons, all their hand-baggages, personal and otherwise, and their luggage should be all completely checked and chances eliminated that there can be any explosive device in them This is most essential.

Apart from that, there are instances, as he said, in which sometimes the detecting device or the X-ray machine fails or is not able to detect. So, there must be double check at that stage. The package checked at one point should be checked again before it is loaded, not only identified. Identification is one thing. But there should be double check so that any failure in the working of the machine does not result in such ghastly tragedy. After all, this tragedy has taken the toll of such precious lives, and it is so tragic that even at the cost of a little bit of overdoing we should try to eliminate all chances of disaster of this nature.

Apart from this, Madam, it has been seen that in all international flights, it is the security arrangement of that particular country which is mostly activated in detecting whether the luggage is free from, or is carrying any, contraband material. Now, my only suggestion is that if Air-India jumbo jet is taking off from a Canada airport, our intelligence people should be deployed at their airport so that they can identify and detect the terrorists. Our intelligence will be in a better position rather than other country's intelligence to identify the terrorists. This suggestion can be raised at IATA meeting or at the Governmental level so that a mutual agreement can be reached on checking and rechecking a shady person. Our intelligence people should be posted at their airport at our cost. That country may raise an objection for posting our security personnel. But for maintaining the safety of our jumbo jets our intelligence people should be posted in foreign countries so that such incidents do not occur.

Of course, the findings will be coming and I am sure there can be no two opinions on this point. Everyone is interested in the safety and security of human beings. It is not a political issue. It is a matter where everybody is deeply interested. We would like to extend our full support in this matter. We are prepared to give our suggestions and participate in the discussions if the Government asks for it. We are prepared to help the Government in ensuring that such incidents do not recure. Thank you.

श्री अशोक गहलोत : महोदया, अभी करीब एक घंटे भर में हमारे माननीय सदस्यों ने जो एयर-इंडिया का जेट विमान दुर्घटनाग्रस्त हुआ और उस दुर्घटना के कारण जिन परिवारों को हानि उठानी पड़ी, उसके लिए अपना दुख प्रकट किया और अपनी संवेदना प्रकट की । मैं सोचता हूं कि हम सब के पास ऐसे कोई शब्द नहीं है, जिन शब्दों के द्वारा हम अपनी संवेदनाओं को उन लोगों तक पहुंचा सकें । माननीय सदस्यों ने और जैसा हमारे अंतिम सदस्य बोले, उन्होंने कहा कि इसमें कोई राजनीतिक बात नहीं है, उससे हट कर ही सबने अपने विचार प्रकट किए । मैं सोचता हूं कि इसमें जो सुझाव मेरे पास आए है, वे भी और भी जो हमारे ऐसे कदम है, जिसके द्वारा हम चाहते है कि जो हवाई सुरक्षा है, जो हमारे हवाई जहाजों की सुरक्षा है, उसमें चलने वाले यात्रियों

की सुरक्षा है, उनको और ज्यादा मजबूत बनाया जाएगा।

महोदया, माननीय सदस्यों ने कई प्रकार के सुझाव अभी हमारे सामने रखे और सिक्योरिटी को लेकर भी चिन्ता प्रकट की। मैं उनकी भावनाओं को महसूस कर रहा हूं और मैं इतना कह सकता हूं कि हम लोगों ने, चूंकि यह जो एअर क्रैश हुआ है, उसके पहले से ही जो धमकियां मिल रही थीं, उसको देखते हुए कई प्रकार के सुरक्षात्मक कदम उठाए थे और यह एअर क्रैश होने के बाद भी हम लोगों ने उसको पूरा रिव्यू किया है। हमारी कोशिश है कि हम लोग इस प्रकार की सिक्योरिटी का अरेंजमेंट करें, जिससे कि कोई भी ऐसा फेल्योर न हो सके, चाहे वह किसी आतंकवादी की कार्यवाही हो, चाहे कोई अन्य प्रकार की बात हो, उसमें सुरक्षात्मक कदमों के कारण कोई कमी न रह जाये।

जैसा कि माननीय सदस्यों को मालूम है कि जो हमारे मंत्रालय की पिछली सलाहकार समिति की बैठक हुई थी, उसमें भी हम लोगों ने और प्रधान मंत्री जी ने स्थिति की गंभीरता को देखते हुए जो एक कमेटी बनाने का निर्णय लिया, जो हमारे पांच संसद-सदस्यों की कमेटी बन चुकी है। हमारी पांच संसद-सदस्यों की कमेटी बन चुकी है, वह इस काम को देख रही है और हमें आशा है कि वह अगस्त के प्रथम सप्ताह तक अपनी रिपोर्ट प्रस्तुत कर देगी जिसको सामने रख कर हम लोग अगली सलाहकार समिति के विचार-विमर्श को आधार बनाकर कुछ फैसले ले सकें, और कुछ नए निर्देश जारी कर सकें।

जहां तक माननीय सदस्य जसवन्त सिंह ने कहा कि जो सर्कुलर निकले थे उन पर पूरी तरह से अमल नहीं हुआ। मैं यह निवेदन करना चाहूंगा ...

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : अशोक जी, मैंने यह नहीं कहा कि जो सर्कुलर पहले निकले थे उन पर अमल नहीं हुआ, मेरा कहना यह था कि जो मार्च, 25, 1983 का सर्कुलर है उस की वजह से ही यह गफलत हुई है। उस सर्कुलर में कहा गया है कि पैसिंजर नहीं आया है, फिर भी पैसिंजर का लगेज प्लेन पर रहेगा और एयरक्राफ्ट का पाइलट उसको डिले नहीं करेगा।

श्री अशोक गहलोत : माननीय सदस्य ने जो सर्कुलर बताया है मैं पहले उसको मंगा कर देख लूंगा। उसके बाद कई सर्कुलर निकल चुके है और स्पष्ट निर्देश दिए जा चुके हैं कि पैसिंजर जब तक आइडेंटीफाई नहीं करेगा तब तक वह नहीं रखा जाएगा।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : आप जो बात बता रहे है वह भी है और जसवन्त सिंह जी जो बता रहे हैं वह भी है। दो परस्पर विरोधी आदेश है।

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : आप गलत न समझिए यह बहस का विषय नहीं है। आपका यह फरमान सही हो सकता है कि आजकल तो सब बेगेज की तलाशी लेते हैं। पर इस एक्सीडेंट से पहले ऐसा नहीं होता था कि बेगेज को आइडेंटीफाइ कीजिए। मैं आपकी नुक्ताचीनी की वजह से यह नहीं कह रहा कि इस सर्कुलर की वजह से गफलत हुई है।

Not as a matter of witch-hunting but please as a matter of corrective of what has gone wrong.

श्री अशोक गहलोत : मैं इस सर्कुलर को देख लूंगा और अगर कोई भी कमी है तो उसको दूर कर दूंगा। जहां तक मैं सोचता हूं, हमने जो पहले निदेश जारी किए थे उनके अन्तर्गत मौंट्रियल और टोरोंटो में एक्सरे मशीनें भी लगाई गई, जिनका जिक्र माननीय सदस्य ने किया था और जिसके बारे में खबर आई थी कि जब चैक हो रहा था वह मशीन बीच में खराब हो गई। अब जो निर्देश है उनका

[श्री अशोक गहलोत]

कड़ाई के साथ पालन किया जा रहा है। जो रजिस्टर्ड बेगेज है वह चैक-इन कराने के बाद जब जमा कराया जाता है तो पहले एक्स-रे मशीन के द्वारा देखा जाता है, फिर उसको सील किया जाता है। उसके बाद वह डिपोजिट हो सकता है। जो नए निर्देश दिए गए है उनमें अंडरटेकिंग को कम्पलसरी कर दिया गया है।

जो मशीन खराब होने की बात कही गयी है उस विषय में मुझे जानकारी दी गई है कि जब मशीन खराब हो गयी है तो जो पी-डी-4 का एक्विपमेंट है बाकी बचे बेगेज को उसके द्वारा चैक किया गया और उसके बाद ही एयरक्राफट में लौड किया गया था।

माननीय सदस्यों ने राय प्रकट की कि जो वी० आई० पी० विशिष्ट व्यक्ति हैं उनके बेगेज की भी साधारण पेसिजर की तरह चेकिंग होनी चाहिए। अभी हमने सुरक्षात्मक जो कदम उठाए है उनमें यह निर्देश भी दिया गया है कि जिनको होम मिनिस्ट्री वी० वी० आई० पी० ट्रीट करती है, जो विदेशी मेहमान आते है उनको छोड़कर — सारे मुख्यमंत्रियों से इस आशय का निवेदन किया है— किसी भी वी० आई० पी० का टर्मिनल पर किसी प्रकार का रिसेप्शन नही किया जाना चाहिए। और इसके साथ-साथ सारे बैगेज को भी चेक करने का प्रावधान किया गया है और मैं ऐसा मानता हूं कि इस काम में किसी प्रकार की गफलत नहीं रहेगी।

जहां तक कंपेसेशन देने की बात कही गयी है और उसके बारे में कुछ जानकारी की मांग की गयी है, मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि हम लोगों ने दिल्ली में, बंबई में और सभी जगहों पर, कनाडा में भी स्पेशल सेल स्थापित किये हैं और वे काम करने लगे है और वे नेक्सट आफ दि किन को पूरा सहयोग कर रहे हैं फार्मेलिटीज को पूरा करने के लिए और हमें उम्मीद है कि कंपसेशन के जो मामले हैं वे सब एयर इंडिया के सहयोग से निपट सकेंगे और उन में कोई दिक्कत आने की संभावना नही है। कुछ यह आशंका प्रकट की गई है कि जो इंश्योरेंस कंपनी है वह किसी प्रकार के आब्जेक्शन कर रही है। हमारे पास इस प्रकार की कोई बात सामने नही आयी है और मैं समझता हूं कि इस में न तो हम से कोई जानकारी मांगी गयी है और न ही इसमें कोई दिक्कत आ सकती है।

एक माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि एयर बस इंडस्ट्री ने जो बीस एयर बसें हम लेने वाले थे लीज पर वह देने से मना कर दिया है। मैं माननीय सदस्यों की जानकारी के लिये कहना चाहूंगा कि हम लोग बीस एयर बसें लेने नही जा रहे है। जो एयर इंडिया का आर्डर 6 एयर बसों के लिये है वह 6 एयर बस हम खरीदने जा रहे है जो हम को 1986 मे, करीब 7-8 महीनों में मिल जायेगी और इस में कोई दिक्कत नही होगी और इस में लीज की कोई बात नही है।

कई आशंकाये, जो अखबारों में भी आयी हैं, कि इस एक्सीडेंट का कारण क्या था, इस को माननीय सदस्य जानना चाहते हैं और ऐसी इच्छा उन्होंने प्रकट की है। और जो कुछ मैं कहना चाहता हूं वह उन्होंने स्वयं ही अपने विचारों में व्यक्त भी कर दिया है कि जब एक हाई कोर्ट का जज इस की इंक्वायरी के लिये बिठा दिया गया है तो मैं ऐसा मानता हूं कि कोई व्यू इस पर प्रकट करना मेरे लिये सम्भव नही होगा। अभी जो एक दल इम्मीडियेटली भेजा था उस ने भी जो रेकेज मिला उस के माध्यम से और जो शव प्राप्त हुये उन की आटोप्सी के माध्यम से कुछ बातों का पता लगाया है। उस वक्त तक काकपिट वायस रेकार्डर या डाटा रेकार्डर हम को नही मिला था। जसवन्त सिंह जी ने शायद कहा कि आप ने इस को एक बहुत बड़ी उपलब्धि बताने की कोशिश की है। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि वास्तव में अगर देखा जाये तो यह अपने आप में एक उपलब्धि है कि इतनी गहराई से कोई चीज इस प्रकार के आपरेशन से निकली है और मेरे मंत्रालय के जो सेक्रेटरी डा० सिद्धू के नेतृत्व में वहां

गये थे, उन के दल में अलग अलग एयर लाइन्स के फ्लाइट सेफ्टी के डाइरेक्टर्स भी थे और कुछ अन्य भी थे उन्होंने जा कर जिस प्रकार से इतना बड़ा हादसा होने के बाद से रेस्क्यू आपरेशन के लिये तत्परता दिखायी, और जिस तरह से उस का मोबालाइज किया, जिस तरह से वहां की सरकारों के साथ कोआर्डिनेट किया यह सब अपने आप में एक बहुत बड़ी बात थी और हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी का निर्देश हम को बराबर मिलते रहे और हमारी उन से सपर्क था और यही कारण था कि सही समय पर यह फैसला हुआ और जैसा कि मैंने अपने स्टेटमेंट में कहा है कि यह लियोन थे विनियस फ्रांस से हायर कर मंगाया गया और उस के कारण ही समय पर यह दोनों चीजें निकल सकीं। अगर उस समय पर यह निर्णय नहीं लिया जाता तो शायद यह संभव नहीं था। हम को उसे हायर करना पड़ा और उन का जो कीमत थी उस से आधी कीमत पर यह उन्होंने हम को देना कबूल किया और उस के कारण ही यह दो महत्वपूर्ण चीजें निकल सकीं। जसवंत सिंह जी से और अन्य सदस्यों से मैं इस बात का निवेदन करूंगा कि अगर यह एफ० डी० आर० सी० वी० आर० नहीं निकाल पाते तो मैं सोचता हूं कि चाहे कितनी बड़ी जांच होती, उसके बावजूद भी लोगों के मन में यह शंका बनी रहेगी कि फ्लाइट रेकार्डर या वायस रेकार्डर मिल जाते तो पता नहीं क्या बात होती। मैं समझता हूं कि इनका निकालना हमारे लिये अच्छी बात है। उससे हमारे जो हाई कोर्ट के जज इंक्वायरी कर रहे हैं, उनके सामने एक पहलू स्पष्ट हुआ है।

मैं भी मानता हूं, जैसा कि सदस्यों ने कहा, कि इंक्वायरी जल्दी पूरी होनी चाहिए। हमने 31 दिसम्बर तक समय दिया है, हमें आशा है कि उस वक्त तक या उससे पहले इंक्वायरी पूरी हो जायेगी ताकि जो हकीकत है, जो फैक्टस है वह हमारे सामने आ सके।

एक माननीय सदस्य ने यह आशंका प्रकट की और अपने प्रदेश का उन्होंने उदाहरण दिया कि हम लोग खाली आतंकवाद का नाम लेकर हकीकत से दूर न हो जायें। मुझे पूरी उम्मीद है कि जो इंक्वायरी होगी, उसके बाद हमारे सामने सही तथ्य आ सकेंगे और तभी जो क्या क्या थ्योरिज चल रही हैं, बम ब्लास्ट की बात हो या ऐक्सप्लोजन की बात हो, हकीकत हमारे सामने आयेगी और जो आशंकायें हैं उनके ऊपर खुलासा होगा और स्पष्ट रूप से रिपोर्ट हमारे सामने आ सकेगी।

जहां तक सुरेश कलमाडी जी ने यह बात कही कि 747 एयरक्राफ्ट जो हैं उनको ग्राउंड कर दिया जाये, मैं समझता हूं कि आप पाइलैट रह चुके है, इस प्रकार के 747 दुनियां भर में बड़ी संख्या मे चल रहे होंगे। इतनी बड़ी जो दुर्घटना हुई है उससे पूरी दुनियां ने मुल्कों का ध्यान गया है सैक्यूरिटी की दृष्टि से भी और स्ट्रक्चरल फैल्यौर की अगर बात आती है तो वे लोग भी इसके बारे मे बराबर विचार कर लेंगे। तो मैं नहीं मानता कि हम लोग इस बारे में कोई बात सोचें कि 747 को ग्राउंड कर दिया जाये, न हमारा कोई इस प्रकार का इरादा है।

जो हमारे ब्लैक बाक्सैज है उनके बारे में आपने कहा कि इसमें शंकायें लोगों में प्रकट की गई है कि ये हमारे देश में नहीं बल्कि अमरीका और इंग्लैंड में उनकी जांच होनी चाहिये, तो मैं समझता हूं कि इनके विश्लेषण करने के हमारे पास पूरे साधन है। उसके बावजूद भी अगर हाई कोर्ट के जज जो इंक्वायरी कर रहे हैं, वह उचित समझते है कि ऐसा करना जरूरी है तो वह निर्णय ले सकते हैं, हमें इसमें कोई आब्जैक्शन नहीं है।

[श्री अशोक गहलोत]

इसके साथ, मैं समझता हूं कि सारी बातें करीब करीब मैंने आपको बता दी हैं। जो अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय सम्मेलन करने की बात कुछ सदस्यों ने सुझाव के तौर पर कही है, मैं ऐसा मानता हूं कि अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संगठन जो सिविल ऐवियेशन के है, अगर वे कोई सम्मेलन हिन्दुस्तान में करना चाहेंगे, इस प्रकार की कांफ्रेंस का वैसे उन लोगों ने विचार किया है, मीटिंग की है, वह अपना विचार बना रहे है। उसके बावजूद भी हमारे देश में इस प्रकार का सम्मेलन होने की बात आएगी तो हम उस पर विचार कर सकेंगे, उसमें हमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं रहेगी और इस प्रकार का दुर्घटनाओं की जांच की बात गहराई में लोगों के ध्यान में लाई जा सकेगी।

कुछ सदस्यों ने यह कहा, कि जैसे गुरुपद स्वामी जी ने भी कहा है, कि दुसरे मुल्कों में इस प्रकार की घटनाएं बहुत कम पीरियड में हुई हैं। इसमें कोई दो राये नहीं है, एक महीना नहीं बल्कि 10–12 दिन के अन्दर जिस प्रकार की हाई जैकिंग की घटनाए फ्रैंकफर्ट, जापान और टोकियो में तीन चार जगहों पर हुई हैं, वे इस बात के लिए एक संकेत हैं कि जो सिविल ऐवियेशन का सैक्टर है, उसको एक बहुत बड़ा धक्का लगा है और एक चिन्ता का वह विषय बन गया है पूरी दुनिया के अन्दर। मैंने यह बात उस वक्त भी कही थी कि इस प्रकार की घटनाएं टैरारिज्म और हाई जैकिंग के कारण क्यों हो रही हैं? और मुझे उम्मीद है कि इतनी बड़ी कीमत चुकाने के बाद यानी एयर इंडिया के जम्बो जैट के दुर्घटनाग्रस्त होने से इतने अधिक परिवारों की मृत्यु हुई है जिसकी हम कल्पना भी नहीं कर सकते, इस कीमत चुकाने के बाद दुनिया, के सारे मुल्क सोचेंगे उनके बारे में जो लोग आतंकवादियों को पनाह देने के लिए, जब उनके पास सुझाव जाते थे तो वह परवाह नहीं करते थे। आज बराबर मैं ऐसा मानता हूं कि इस घटना के बाद दुनिया के मुल्कों में जहां-जहां आतंकवादी लोग हैं, असामाजिक तत्व हैं उन पर कड़ी से कड़ी कार्रवाई करने के लिए फैसले लिए जायें ध्यान रखेंगे कि अगर कोई टैरेरिस्ट चाहे कोई दूसरे मुल्क का है अगर वह हमारे यहां गतिविधियां चलाता है तो कभी वह हमारी अपनी सरकार को भी नुकसान पहुंचा सकता है। इस प्रकार मैं सोच सकता हूं कि इतनी बड़ी कीमत चुकाने के बाद एयर इंडिया को यात्रियों की सुरक्षा के लिए और अधिक मजबूती के साथ सोचना होगा जिससे ऐसी कोई घटना भविष्य में न हो।

एक माननीय सदस्य ने यह कहा है कि जो टोकियो में बम्ब ब्लास्ट हुआ था उसका और इसका क्या संबन्ध है? मैं इतना ही निवेदन कर सकता हूं कि जो फैक्ट्स है उसमें 53 मिनट पहले कनिष्का की दुर्घटना के वहां घटना घटी थी। दोनों का क्या संबंध है इसके बारे में जब हमारे सामने जांच रिपोर्ट आ जाएगी उसके बाद ही कुछ कहा जा सकेगा। इन शब्दों के साथ मैं माननीय सदस्यों को धन्यवाद दूंगा कि आपने कई नए सुझावों की ओर मेरा ध्यान आकृष्ट किया है। मैं कोशिश करूंगा कि आपके जो सुझाव हैं वह मेरे लिए, जो नए कदम उठाए जायेंगे उसमें वह काम आ सके।

श्री बी० सत्यनारायण रेड्डी : टैरिरिस्ट आर्गेनाइजेशन ने जो कहा है उसके बारे में आपने कुछ नहीं बताया।

श्री अशोक गहलोत : बात यहां आकर टिकती है कि हमें कोई टेलिफोन करता है तो हम किसी नतीजे पर नहीं पहुंच सकते। वह सारे इससे जड़े हुये प्रश्न हैं। जो जांच आयोग जांचकर रहा है उसकी पूरी जांच होने के बाद ही कहा जा सकेगा कि वास्तव में जो उन्होंने कहा है कि इस विस्फोट में उनका हाथ है वह सही है या नहीं। उसके बाद ही पता लग सकेगा कि यह घटना कैसे घटी है और वास्तविकता क्या है? किसी भी नतीजे पर पहुंचने के लिये बहुत जरूरी है कि जो कोर्ट बैठाया गया है, उसकी फाईडिंगस की, उसकी रिपोर्ट की हम इंतजार करें।

श्री धर्मचन्द्र प्रशांत (जम्मू और काश्मीर) : यहां एक माननीय सदस्य ने कुछ समाचार पत्रों में छपा है कि जिस वक्त कनिष्क उड़ान भरने लगा था तो एक पैकेट पायलेट को दिया गया था और उसने पहले खाना भी खाया। मैं यह जानना

चाहता हू कि जो तहकीकात कराने जा रहे है या हो रही है उसमे यह बात आई है या नही ?

श्री अशोक गहलोत : इसके लिये हमने वहां से रिपोर्ट मागी है और मैं समझता हू कि जितनी भी हम लोग इन्फरमेशन मांग रहे है जैसा मैने पहले कहा कि हाई कोर्ट के जज साहब जो जाच कर रहे है उनको दी जा रही है जिसमे वह किसी नतीजे पर पहुचने मे सफलता प्राप्त कर सकें । धन्यवाद ।

THE COAL MINES (CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT) AMENDMENT BILL, 1984.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI KANAK MUKHERJEE): Now, we will continue with the discussion on the Coal Mines (Development and Regulation) Amendment Bill, 1984. The discussion on this Bill started on the 14th March 1985. Now, Mr. Sukomal Sen is to finish his speech. Yes, Mr. Sukomal Sen.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Madam, I am rising not to oppose this particular Bill as such. But, since this is about conservation and development of coal mines, I would like to make some observations on certain relevant points relating to this Bill.

Coal, as we all know, is an exhaustible item and, according to some experts, our coal reserves are going to be exhausted by the middle of the next century. I do not know how far it is correct. But that is the estimate made by some experts and, as such, conservation and development of coal is of the utmost importance to our country. Madam, I find that the manner in which the Coal-India and the Government are managing the coal-mines is not at all helping the conservation and development of coal mines. On the other hand, certain incidents have taken place which are greatly affecting the coal-mines and hampering develpment, and instead of conserving the coal reserves it is causing colossal wastage to this precious reserve of our country. I will give examples, one by one. I will try to be very brief.

Million of tonnes of coal are lying underground in the form of pillars. I think in other countries de-pillaring is done in order to utilize the coal, that is, after extraction of coal. But in India in our coalmines his de-pillaring is not being done. As a result, a huge quantity of coal is being wasted in the coalmines.

Secondly, Madam, Coal-India, after extracting a certain amount of coal from the mines declare certain mines as abandoned, although a huge reserve of coal still remains in those mines. What happens afterwards? Afterwards illegal mining takes place and illegal mining takes place in such a way that it endangers the life of the workers who are engaged in this illegal mining by some private parties. There are numerous reports coming out in newspapers that in various coalmines workers have been killed while conducting illegal mining, and there are reports also that some officials of Coal-India and some mafia gangs are combined together in this operation of illegal mining. And there is another startling report that even in the Central Industrial Security Force which is deployed in the coalmines area certain personnel also are colluding in this operation of illegal mining. There is another report to which I would like to draw the attention of the hon. Minister. In Bihar there is very big coalfields and the Bihar Government—I do not know for what reason—are encouraging private mining in certain coalifields. I would like the Minister kindly to anquire into this allegation. Then, there is another aspect. Thous. ands of tonnes of coal is being wasted by underground fire. Particularly there are reports that in the Jharia-Raniganj coal belt the underground fire is destroying a huge quantity of coal. In fact, the Raniganj town it-